

HISTORY OF POLITICAL AND SOCIO-ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT OF TURKEY AND TATARSTAN RELATIONS AT THE END OF XX – THE BEGINNING OF THE 21ST CENTURIES

Мураталиев Д.Р., Имамудинова А.М.

ABSTRACT

Interest of Turkey in development of commercial ties with territorial subjects of the Russian Federation – one of the new and important directions in the strategy of the Turkish side oriented to expand the export. As for Russia such strategy promoted involvement of the increasing number of territorial subjects of the Russian Federation. Subjects of the Russian Federation are also interested in the relations and attraction of foreign investments for the purpose of production upgrade. Considering the capacity of Turkey, it is worth outlining that Turkey possesses the developed food and textile industry, and also vigorous investing activities in regions of the Russian Federation. At the same time certain territorial subjects of the Russian Federation, and in particular, Tatarstan and Bashkortostan, have such developed industries as mechanical engineering and metal working. Factors of interest in development of communications with Turkey in territorial subjects of the Russian Federation have not only economic character, but also are supplemented with the interest in each other which is based on cultural and ethnic proximity.

Keywords: *political development, Turkey, Tatarstan*

INTRODUCTION

The first economic relations of Turkey¹ with territorial subjects of the federation including the Volga region, appears in the 1990th after the collapse of the USSR. At the same time also began to be performed both visits of foreign businessmen, and foreign economic activity.²

It is worth mentioning that the existing legal base for development of foreign economic activity of territorial subjects of the Russian Federation is characterized by availability of certain contradictions and discrepancies. The right of subjects to independent foreign economic activity isn't reflected in the Constitution of the Russian Federation, formally they have no right to establish economic relations with foreign states.

The history of Tatarstan and Turkey relations has very old roots and is based on interest of the parties in development of trade and economic relations, and on cultural historical links of two Turkic people throughout several centuries.³

According to Nigamatzyanov R. A., the 1990th are considered as time of forming of political, economic and cultural relations between Tatarstan and Turkey.⁴

Let's note what the first establishment of direct connections of Turkey and Tatarstan was based by the Turkish businessmen. On the first place it is possible to allocate Erturk Deger. He headed the

¹ Валидова А.Ф. Экономические реформы Турции: уроки для России и Татарстана / А.Ф. Валидова. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2007. – С. 53.

² Ягудин Б.М. О развитии политических, торгово–экономических и культурных отношений Татарстана и Турции (90-е годы XX в.) // Российско–турецкие отношения: история, современное состояние и перспективы. – М.: Институт востоковедения РАН, 2003. – С. 270.

³ Валидова А.Ф. Экономические реформы Турции: уроки для России и Татарстана / А.Ф. Валидова. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2007. – С. 54.

⁴ Нигаматзянов Р.А. Торгово-экономические отношения между Татарстаном и Турцией на рубеже XX–XXI веков // Отечественная османистика и туркология: итоги и перспективы: Доклады и сообщения международного научно–практического семинара, 2 июля 2009 года, проведенного в рамках II Евразийского научного форума. – Казань: Intelpress+, 2009. - С. 191.

«Degere Interprays Group» company. Same year the visit of the prime minister of Tatarstan Sabirov M. S. to Turkey was organized and it is estimated so: «... the management of Turkey recognized sovereignty of Tatarstan». This visit became an important event in the relations of the Republic of Turkey and the Republic of Tatarstan.⁵ So, in 1991 the first Tatar-Turkish entity of «Taturos» was created for the purpose of Tatarstan trade mission in Turkey.

According to Validova A. F., integration of the Republic of Tatarstan into the world economy was one more purpose of «Taturos» activities. Since 1991 to the middle of 1996 through «Taturos» Tatarstan realized 1,5 million t. oils, from Turkey buses «Mercedes Benz-Tyurk» and food were imported. However attachment of the Tatarstan-Turkish trade to activities of one firm resulted in trade stagnation.⁶

At the beginning of the 90th visits of the President of the Republic of Tatarstan M. Shaimiev were strong impulses in development of the relations. Its meetings with heads of the Republic of Turkey, as well as with large businessmen of the country,⁷ became results of signing a number of trade and economic agreements.

Let's note that on February 15, 1994 in Moscow the Agreement of the Russian Federation and the Republic of Tatarstan «About differentiation of areas of jurisdiction and a mutual authority delegation between public authorities of the Russian Federation and public authorities of the Republic of Tatarstan» was signed. This agreement became a basis of those changes which happened in the republic from the moment of its signing. The sovereignty fixed in it which granted the republic the right to dispose of all natural and economic resources led to essential economic growth.

The Russian constitution recognizes the right of the subject to develop foreign economic relations, but provided that all activities shall be coordinated by the federal center, that is the MFA.

In general, it is possible to note that the relations between Turkey and Tatarstan developed parallel to development of the relations between the Russian Federation and the Republic of Turkey⁸ as in economic, cultural, and political spheres, however, of course having some specifics.

The agreement between the Government of the Republic of Tatarstan and the Government of the Republic of Turkey on a trade and economic, scientific and technical and cultural cooperation signed on May 22, 1995 and which laid the foundation of bilateral relations between the republics was an important stage in development of the relations.⁹ The main areas of a cooperation were in this respect determined: the industry, namely fuel and energy, extracting, light industry and agriculture; building and construction services; transport and transport services; trade; preparation and personnel training; tourism. In the agreement the place and cultural, national and educational ties were also allocated. The parties undertook to keep development of a cultural cooperation, to make efforts for mutual studying languages, to help a cooperation in the field of science and education. Besides other agreements were signed: The agreement on joint activities of the Ministry of national education of RT and Fund of researches of the Turkic world on opening of schools, lyceums and universities within a cooperation of TP and PT; The Memorandum of a cooperation between agency on development of international cooperation in case of the Ministry of external commercial relations RT and the Turkish agency on

⁵ Ягудин Б.М. О развитии политических, торгово-экономических и культурных отношений Татарстана и Турции (90-е годы XX в.) // Российско-турецкие отношения: история, современное состояние и перспективы. – М.: Институт востоковедения РАН, 2003. – С. 270.

⁶ Валидова А.Ф. Экономические реформы Турции: уроки для России и Татарстана / А.Ф. Валидова. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2007. – С. 55

⁷ Ягудин Б.М. О развитии политических, торгово-экономических и культурных отношений Татарстана и Турции (90-е годы XX в.) // Российско-турецкие отношения: история, современное состояние и перспективы. – М.: Институт востоковедения РАН, 2003. – С. 273.

⁸ Валидова А.Ф. Экономические реформы Турции: уроки для России и Татарстана / А.Ф. Валидова. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2007. – С. 55

⁹ Ягудин Б.М. О развитии политических, торгово-экономических и культурных отношений Татарстана и Турции (90-е годы XX в.) // Российско-турецкие отношения: история, современное состояние и перспективы. – М.: Институт востоковедения РАН, 2003. – С. 273.

international cooperation (1996); The Protocol on a cooperation between the Grand National Assembly of Turkey and the State Council of RT of June 20, 1996.

For the purpose of creating conditions for implementation of these agreements and to continue the development of friendship between the republics in 1996 the Consulate general of the Republic of Turkey in Kazan opens. The consulate general performs a lot of work on development of bilateral ties in the field of economy, trade, investments, science and technology.

Within the next year, the Authorized Representation of the Republic of Tatarstan in the Republic of Turkey according to the Presidential decree of the Republic of Tatarstan was created on September 13, 1997. Official opening of Representation took place on April 14, 1998 to Istanbul. The authorized Government became the coordinator created at the end of 1998 «Tatarstan» trading House in Turkey.¹⁰

For several years the Republic of Tatarstan took active part in Russian-Turkish Business Council of «DEIK» founded in 1986.¹¹ On December 20-27, 1996 in Turkey, in a work progress of the 5th joint sitting of the Russian-Turkish Business Council the meeting and the first Tatarstan-Turkish Business committee took place. Tatarstan and Turkey agreed about exchange of information in the fields of trade, investments, the equipment and sciences.¹² However It should be noted that a cooperation basis, certainly, is import of energy raw materials by Turkey from Russia including Tatarstan.¹³

After signing the contractual legal base between the parties, negotiations with representatives of firms and organizations were initiated. A number of agreements were signed both with private firms and with the entities. The chronology of visits of delegations looks as follows.

In June, 1995 a representative delegation of the Union of Chambers of Commerce and Industry and exchanges of Turkey visited Tatarstan. Following the results of a visit delivery contracts to Turkey of the Tatarstan medicines, sheepskins, polyethylene, products from it, detergents, spare parts to the «KamAZ» cars, a metalwork, and also deliveries to the Republic of Tatarstan products from skin, food, textiles were signed.

From May 4 to May 7, 1998 the visit to the Republic of Tatarstan of the State minister of the Republic of Turkey A. Andizhan considered as an important step in the relations between the Republic of Tatarstan and the Republic of Turkey took place.

Representatives of the Republic of Tatarstan participated in the 7th (October, 1999) and the 8th (November, 2000) joint sittings of the Russian-Turkish Business Council of «DEIK».

From May 31 to June 2, 2000 the visit to the Republic of Tatarstan of representatives of the «Ramenko» company during which the possibility of a construction in Kazan of «Ramstor» hypermarket was discussed. Following the results of a visit the agreement on investment of hypermarket construction in Kazan was reached.¹⁴ Following the results of 2007 5 «Ramstor» supermarkets of this company worked in our republic already.

¹⁰ Валидова А.Ф. Экономические реформы Турции: уроки для России и Татарстана / А.Ф. Валидова. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2007. – С. 55-57.

¹¹ Туран Г. Роль Турецко-Российского делового Совета в системе экономических отношений между Турцией и Россией // Российско–турецкие отношения: история, современное состояние и перспективы. – М.: Институт востоковедения РАН, 2003. – С. 197.

¹² Валидова А.Ф. Экономические реформы Турции: уроки для России и Татарстана / А.Ф. Валидова. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2007. – С. 57.

¹³ Казган. Г. Запад и турецко–российские отношения. Г. Казган, [пер. Н. Ю. Ульченко, Е. И. Уразовой, С. Л. Логуновой] // Российско–турецкие отношения: история, современное состояние и перспективы. – М.: Институт востоковедения РАН, 2003. – С.136.

¹⁴ Валидова А.Ф. Экономические реформы Турции: уроки для России и Татарстана / А.Ф. Валидова. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2007. – С. 57-59.

It should be noted that Turkey wins first place by the number of the joint businesses registered in the territory of Tatarstan. Today, in Tatarstan over two hundred entities work with the Turkish equity that constitutes more than a third of all entities of the republic.¹⁵

Since October 7-14, 2000 a business forum took place in Palmi, Turkey. At this forum not only entrepreneurs of Tatarstan and Turkey participated, but also other regions of the Volga region. During the business forum considerable success in such areas as tourism, expansion of mutually deliveries was achieved: construction materials, fruit, vegetables, petrochemical products and electronics. Later, from October 19 to October 23 in Ankara 5 meetings of the Mixed Intergovernmental Russian-Turkish commission on a trade and economic cooperation between Turkey and Tatarstan took place. Achievements of JSC Nizhnekamskneftekhim in the Turkish market were noted.

In 2001 to Kazan the 9th meeting of the Russian-Turkish Business Council was organized. During the meeting, such aspects as negative changes in the relations of the parties, and especially reduction of amounts of a mutual goods turnover and rendering services in comparison with previous years were also affected.

In July, 2002 the visit to Turkey of government delegation of the Republic of Tatarstan headed by the prime minister of the Republic of Tatarstan R. N. Minnikhanov as a part of the Minister of Trade and the external economic cooperation of RT H.M took place. Salikhov, CEO of JSC «Tatneft» Sh. F. Takhautdinov, CEO of JSC «Nizhnekaskneftekhim» and deputy director general of JSC «KamAZ» A. K. Samarenkin. Meetings and negotiations with the state minister of Turkey Y. Karakoyunla, the Deputy Prime Minister of Turkey M. Yylmaz, the Minister of Energy and Natural Resources Z. Chakan, a management of «IS Bank», «Tupras» state-owned company and the «PetrolOfici» company took place.¹⁶ Oil supply questions from Tatarstan to Turkey were discussed. Besides, questions of deliveries to Turkey of the "KAMAZ" cargo vehicles, avia products - and instrument making, goods of a petrochemical complex were considered.

Following the results of a visit the contract between JSC «Tatneft» and «Tupras» for delivery of 80 thousand tons of oil in November, 2002 is signed. Also the contract between JSC «Tatneft» and «PetrolOfici» for delivery to 50 thousand tons of dizel fuel a month from the Kremenchuk oil refinery is signed. At the beginning of December, 2002 JSC «Tatneft» was signed by the delivery contract of the «Tupras» company of 2,4 million tons of oil in 2003.

In October, 2002 the meeting of the President of the Republic of Tatarstan M. Sh. Shaimiev with the President of Turkey Ahmet Necdet Sezer took place in Ankara. Successful development of bilateral ties between Turkey and Tatarstan was noted. Questions further trade and economic and a sci-tech cooperation were discussed.

In January, 2003 in the Ministry to trade and the external economic cooperation of the Republic of Tatarstan negotiations with the Consul general of the Republic Turkey in Kazan I. S. Edzheer took place. In March, 2003 the visit to the Republic of Tatarstan of the Chairman of the Turkish-Russian Business Council T. Gyur took place. During negotiations in the Ministry of Trade and the external economic cooperation of the Republic of Tatarstan questions of increase in deliveries to Turkey oil and oil products, and also "KamAZ" cargo vehicles and the «Oka» cars were discussed; the organization of coproduction of mineral fertilizers based on SUE «Tatazot»; a possibility of the organization of production of household appliances, joint with the Turkish companies, at the entities of the Republic of Tatarstan and implementation of joint projects in building industry. Besides,

¹⁵ Осипова А.П. Российско-турецкое сотрудничество: тенденции развития // Турция Татарстан: на пути к стратегическому партнерству. Материалы Международной научно-практической конференции. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2008. – С. 79.

¹⁶ Валидова А.Ф. Экономические реформы Турции: уроки для России и Татарстана / А.Ф. Валидова. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2007. – С. 57-59.

interest of the Turkish producers in increase in deliveries to Tatarstan of goods wide deliveries to Tatarstan of mass sales items was noted.¹⁷

Turkey renders Tatarstan assistance in a transportation of freights through the Turkish ports. Through them were more than 3 thousand «KamAZ» cars are delivered to Iraq. At the end of 2003 JSC «Tatneft» implemented the agreement on delivery to Turkey of 3,5 million tons of oil from the Kremenchuk oil refinery. Turkey bought oil in Russia only from «Tatneft».¹⁸

For the purpose of a bigger expansion as cultural, so trade and economic and a sci-tech cooperation in February, 2004 the delegation of Tatarstan visited Turkey. Meetings with the Minister of Finance Kemal Unakitan and from Premieres – the minister Redzhop Tayyip Erdogan took place. The near-term outlook of development of interrelations was discussed. In February, 2004 JSC «Tatneft» became the consumer of the tender for purchase of state-owned shares of the «Tupras» company – 65,7% of the shares «Tupras».

In December, 2004 as a part of official Russian delegation Turkey was visited by the President of the Republic of Tatarstan M. Sh. Shaimiev. During the meeting negotiations of the President of the Russian Federation V. Putin with the President of Turkey A. Césaire took place.

Following the results of negotiations a number of bilateral documents and a number of intergovernmental agreements and memorandums between the Russian and Turkish organizations and departments were also signed.¹⁹

2006 was very saturated in respect of holding meetings and visits of delegations, the majority of which was directed to expansions of a trade and economic cooperation. For example, it is possible to carry a meeting on February 17 of the President of the Republic of Tatarstan M. Sh. Shaimiev with the Turkish delegation led by Kurtulush Tashkent²⁰ – the Ambassador of the Republic of Turkey. In the course problems and questions of mutually beneficial cooperation were discussed.

On May 30, 2006 the 7th meeting of the Mixed Russian-Turkish Intergovernmental commission took place. During a meeting questions of further increase in trade and economic relations, including in fuel and energy complex, an oil and gas industry were considered.

During the period the visit to RT of delegation of the Republic of Turkey led by the deputy director of General contractual and legal department of the State secretariat of foreign trade of the Republic of Turkey mister Hassan Yalchyn took place from November 15 to November 17, 2006. Within the visit meetings with a management of JSC «Kazanskaya fair» at which questions of holding exhibitions were discussed, and also with the chairman of the board of Chamber of Commerce and Industry of RT Sh. R. Ageev took place, year questions of development of a cooperation of entrepreneurs of Turkey and the Republic of Tatarstan were stipulated. Following the results of a visit in the Ministry of Trade and the external economic cooperation of the Republic of Tatarstan the Action plan on development of relations in the sphere of foreign trade and investments between the Republic of Turkey and the Republic of Tatarstan for 2007 was constituted and initialed.

¹⁷ Валидова А.Ф. Экономические реформы Турции: уроки для России и Татарстана / А.Ф. Валидова. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2007. – С. 60.

¹⁸ Андреева Н.И. Основные направления сотрудничества Турции и Татарстана // Турция Татарстан: на пути к стратегическому партнерству. Материалы Международной научно-практической конференции. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2008. – С. 10.

¹⁹ Осипова А.П. Российско-турецкое сотрудничество: тенденции развития // Турция Татарстан: на пути к стратегическому партнерству. Материалы Международной научно-практической конференции. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2008. – С. 80.

²⁰ Кабирова А.Х. О развитии торгово-экономических связей Татарстана с Турцией // Турция Татарстан: на пути к стратегическому партнерству. Материалы Международной научно-практической конференции. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2008. – С. 61.

During 1995-2008 visits of the president of Tatarstan were numerous, there were meetings with presidents of Turkey S. Demirel and A. N. Césaire, the prime minister of Turkey R. T. Erdogan.²¹ In February, 2009 Kazan is visited by the president of Turkey A. Gyulyem. Similar meetings, usually were followed by agreement signature about continuation of full cooperation.²²

Therefore, during last twenty years, Tatarstan and Turkey signed a number of agreement, there were also meetings of presidents of the republics and official visits of delegations. All this influenced formation of legal base of the bilateral relations and created conditions for a further cooperation to firms and the companies.²³

It should be noted that national, cultural ties between Turkey and the Republic of Tatarstan are considered as an auxiliary link for forming of base of commercial ties. They are based on a historical community of languages and national cultures, are equitable to radical interests of the people of the Republic of Tatarstan and the Republic of Turkey and help adjust a cooperation. Education and cultures, development of business contacts is considered as one of the directions of the bilateral economic relations today.²⁴ For example, carrying out Sabantuy holiday in Turkey. In Turkey there pass a training students and government employees of Tatarstan.²⁵

Today the cooperation with Turkey for the Republic of Tatarstan is strategically important, at the same time special significance is attached to development of mutually beneficial relations in trade and economic area. With respect thereto development of trade relations, investing activities and cooperation in all spheres of economic activity of two republics requires the separate analysis.

REFERENCES

- Андреева Н.И. Основные направления сотрудничества Турции и Татарстана // *Турция Татарстан: на пути к стратегическому партнерству. Материалы Международной научно-практической конференции.* – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2008. – 436 с.
- Валидова А.Ф. Экономические реформы Турции: уроки для России и Татарстана / А.Ф. Валидова. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2007. – 76 с.
- Кабирова А.Х. О развитии торгово-экономических связей Татарстана с Турцией. // *Турция Татарстан: на пути к стратегическому партнерству. Материалы Международной научно-практической конференции.* – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2008. – 436 с.
- Нигаматзянов Р.А. Визит Абдуллы Гюля в Казань как новый этап в отношениях между Татарстаном и Турцией. // *Исламоведческие исследования в современной России и СНГ: достижения, проблемы, перспективы: материалы I международного научно-практического симпозиума (19-20 февраля 2009 г.): в 2 томах.* – Том I / Под ред. Б.М. Ягудина. – Казань: «Intelpress+», 2009. – 200 с.
- Нигаматзянов Р.А. Торгово-экономические отношения между Татарстаном и Турцией на рубеже XX – XXI веков // *Отечественная османистика и туркология: итоги и перспективы:*

²¹ Нигаматзянов Р.А. Торгово-экономические отношения между Татарстаном и Турцией на рубеже XX–XXI веков // *Отечественная османистика и туркология: итоги и перспективы: Доклады и сообщения международного научно-практического семинара, 2 июля 2009 года, проведенного в рамках II Евразийского научного форума.* – Казань: Intelpress+, 2009. - С. 192.

²² Нигаматзянов Р.А. Визит Абдуллы Гюля в Казань как новый этап в отношениях между Татарстаном и Турцией // *Исламоведческие исследования в современной России и СНГ: достижения, проблемы, перспективы: материалы I международного научно-практического симпозиума (19-20 февраля 2009 г.): в 2 томах.* – Том I./ Под ред. Б.М. Ягудина. – Казань: «Intelpress+», 2009. – С. 179.

²³ Валидова А.Ф. Экономические реформы Турции: уроки для России и Татарстана / А.Ф. Валидова. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2007. – С. 60-61.

²⁴ Валидова А.Ф. Экономические реформы Турции: уроки для России и Татарстана / А.Ф. Валидова. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2007. – С. 61-62.

²⁵ Андреева Н.И. Основные направления сотрудничества Турции и Татарстана // *Турция Татарстан: на пути к стратегическому партнерству. Материалы Международной научно-практической конференции.* – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2008. – С. 10.

- Доклады и сообщения международного научно – практического семинара, 2 июля 2009 года, проведенного в рамках II Евразийского научного форума. – Казань: Intelpress+, 2009. – 200 с.*
- Осипова А.П. Российско-турецкое сотрудничество: тенденции развития // Турция Татарстан: на пути к стратегическому партнерству. Материалы Международной научно-практической конференции. – Казань: Изд-во Познание, 2008. – 436 с.*
- Ягудин Б.М. О развитии политических, торгово – экономических и культурных отношений Татарстана и Турции (90-е годы XX в.) // Российско–Турецкие отношения: история, современное состояние и перспективы. – М.: Институт востоковедения РАН, 2003.– 301 с.*
- Казган. Г. Запад и Турецко–Российские отношения / Г. Казган, [пер. Н. Ю. Ульченко, Е. И. Уразовой, С. Л. Логуновой] // Российско–турецкие отношения: история, современное состояние и перспективы. – М.: Институт востоковедения РАН, 2003. – 301 с.*
- Туран Г. Роль Турецко-Российского делового Совета в системе экономических отношений между Турцией и Россией // Российско–турецкие отношения: история, современное состояние и перспективы. – М.: Институт востоковедения РАН, 2003. – 301 с.*